

Unconfirmed MINUTES

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICERS' ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING (CEOAC 05/2020)

19 November 2020
Commenced at 2:00 pm

Meeting held electronically

CONTENTS

1. DECLARATION OF OPENING	3
2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE AND APOLOGIES	3
3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES	3
4. MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION	4
4.1 Confidential Report – DiCOM Facility	4
4.2 Confidential Report – Waste to Energy Tender	4
5. INFORMATION ITEMS	5
5.1 WMRC Council Meeting Outcomes	5
5.2 Town of Cambridge starts Verge Valet collections	5
5.3 Waste Plans Progress	6
5.4 Timing of FOGO transition	7
5.5 Operations Report	7
5.6 Communications and Education Report	9
5.7 Financial Report	9
5.8 Progress on CEOAC Recommendations	10
6. GENERAL BUSINESS	11
6.1 CEOAC Meeting Dates 2021	11
7. CLOSURE OF MEETING	11
Next Meeting	11

WMRC Member Councils

Town of Claremont | Town of Cottesloe | Town of Mosman Park | City of Subiaco | Shire of Peppermint Grove
with Town of Cambridge

1. DECLARATION OF OPENING

Welcome and opening of meeting at 2:03 by Deputy Chair Liz Ledger, CEO of the Town of Claremont in the absence of Don Burnett, Chair.

2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE AND APOLOGIES

Member	Position	Council
Mr D Norgard	Director Technical Services	Shire of Peppermint Grove
Ms C Bywater	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Mosman Park
Ms L Ledger (Deputy Chair)	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Claremont
Mr M Scott	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Cottesloe
Mr Cliff Frewing	Chief Executive Officer (Acting)	City of Subiaco
Visitors	Position	Council / Organisation
Mr S Frodsham	Chief Executive Officer	WMRC
Ms L Eustance	Manager Communications & Education	WMRC
Mr K Swift	Manager Operations	WMRC
Ms A Bell	Manager Finance & Governance	WMRC

Leave of Absence

Nil

Apologies

Don Burnett, CEO of the Shire of Peppermint Grove.

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

Draft minutes from the CEOAC meeting held on 17 September 2020 are at **Attachment 1**.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

3.1 The minutes of the CEOAC meeting held on 17 September 2020 be accepted as a true and proper record of that meeting.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED: 5/0

4. MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION

4.1 Confidential Report – DiCOM Facility

The WMRC Chief Executive Officer will speak to the immediately previous confidential reports, emails and minutes which have been circulated to CEOAC members. The protocol followed is that all confidential and other information provided to WMRC Councillors is copied to CEOAC members.

The confidential reports, emails and minutes referred to above are not reproduced as an attachment to this agenda, but members are reminded they are:

- DiCOM Confidential Progress Report of 24 September 2020 dealt with at the WMRC Ordinary Meeting of 1 October 2020.

Members will be updated verbally on any new developments.

Answers to questions from members will be provided where possible.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

4.1.1 The verbal report of the WMRC CEO be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED: 5/0

4.2 Confidential Report – Waste to Energy Tender

The Manager Operations will speak about the assessment of the responses to the WMRC Waste to Energy tender which has been under consideration since mid-July.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

4.2.1 The verbal report of the WMRC Manager Operations be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Matt Scott CARRIED: 5/0

5. INFORMATION ITEMS

5.1 WMRC Council Meeting Outcomes

WMRC held its most recent OCM on 1 October 2020. The Council at the meeting:

- Adopted the WMRC Annual Report subject to amendments to the financials required by the OAG;
- approved the rates for prepaid Verge Valet Extra collections;
- accepted the WMRC Waste Plan;
- endorsed the 2020-21 Occupational Health and Safety Management Plan.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.1.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED: 5/0

5.2 Town of Cambridge starts Verge Valet collections

The Town of Cambridge have become the third council in our catchment area to take on the increasingly popular Verge Valet bulk waste collection service. Following in the footsteps of Mosman Park and Cottesloe, Verge Valet pickups began in the Town of Cambridge on November 3rd. Given the size of the Cambridge council area, Verge Valet pickups take place over two days (Tues / Wed) with approximately 120 collections available on each day. As expected early take up of the service has been high with over 650 bookings so far. Weeks 2 and 3 of the service are fully allocated with week 4 also expected to reach maximum capacity for collections.

As the Town is not a Member Council, but a Participating Council, and therefore services provided by the WMRC do not fall under the Establishment Agreement, the WMRC had a commercial contract drafted by our lawyers to cover activities provided for in the Verge Valet service. This contract has since been signed by Town of Cambridge. The contract can also be used if other "Participating Councils" request the service. For Member Councils, an MOU is sufficient to clarify the relationships between parties, owing to the umbrella coverage of the Establishment Agreement.

WMRC personnel have been working closely with Cambridge staff to ensure the roll out to Cambridge residents has been as smooth as possible. The transition from traditional bulk pickups to "on demand" verge style collections requires a great deal of communications with both council officers, who are learning the service for the first time, and residents. WMRC staff conducted two training sessions with Town of Cambridge staff to introduce them to the new service. A total of 30 Town of Cambridge staff members attended those training sessions. The Town of Cambridge staff have been active online to promote the system to their residents. The WMRC's Recycling Hotline has been extremely busy since the introduction of the Cambridge Verge Valet service.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.2.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Donovan Norgard Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED: 5/0

5.3 Waste Plans Progress

The WMRC has been progressing waste plan production with all five Member Councils. The current status is as shown below:

Council	Feedback status from DWER	Waste plan status as at early September 2020
Town of Claremont	V1 feedback 1 Sept	To be presented to Council Feb 2021
Town of Cottesloe	V2 feedback on 3 July	To be presented to Council Nov 2020
Town of Mosman Park	V2 feedback on 14 July	To be presented to Council Feb 2021
Shire of Peppermint Grove	Final submitted for endorsement 29 October	Accepted by Council, with DWER for finalisation
City of Subiaco	V2 feedback 25 March	Accepted by Council subject to assessment of community feedback (68 replies, all but 6 positive). To be re-presented to Council Dec 2020.
Western Metropolitan Regional Council	Final submitted for endorsement 7 Oct	Accepted by Council, with DWER for finalisation

Part 1 of the plan provides the context/baseline against which Part 2; the Implementation Plan is developed. Councils to sign off on Part 2 of the Plan as this sets out how the local governments will deliver their services going forward (See Section 43(2) of the WARR Act 2007). Once a waste plan is accepted by Council, CEOs send the plan alongside a signed self-assessment checklist to DWER for approval.

On assessing the two Waste Plans currently submitted to DWER for finalising, there have been indications of concern by DWER that there will be a period, albeit limited, when WMRC Member Councils will be sending residual waste from a GO three bin system to Waste to Energy prior to the introduction of FOGO (see 5.4). There may be a need to slightly amend Waste Plans to take that concern into account.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.3.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Donovan Norgard CARRIED: 5/0

5.4 Timing of FOGO transition

One feature common to all Member Council waste plans is the plan to transition to FOGO by the DWER target date of 2025. WMRC's waste plan includes a commitment to support that transition; and the West Metro RC is already licensed to receive FOGO waste. However, enquiries with potential processors have so far not resulted in any particularly attractive options. Modelling of the cost impost includes the following:

Changeover costs

- including caddies and liners, some new bins, education and promotion.
- DWER Better Bins go FOGO funding is available, but falls well short of the anticipated full cost

Ongoing operational costs

- Processing costs are higher than our currently very low GO processing costs
- Haulage costs are high for distant facilities,
- This is offset by a reduction in the treatment costs for the residual bins caused by food organics being diverted from these bins. The quantum of this reduction is dependent on the waste levy rate; anticipated to rise significantly from 1 July 2021.

The modeling assumes that FOGO waste is delivered to the West Metro RC for consolidation and efficient transport; an estimated minimum of 10T of FOGO material is required per day for this to be realistic; haulage costs rise in alternate scenarios. In effect we require around 7000 households moving to FOGO at once; an increase in that number has the potential to decrease per tonne haulage costs.

Experience elsewhere in WA indicates that the logistical, education and promotional effort to prepare for a successful FOGO transition is high. The potential for confusion between residents with GO bins and those with FOGO bins in adjacent suburbs is also high; particularly when ostensibly the same truck services both. This suggests that a degree of coordination between Member Councils in the transition is appropriate. This can also serve to reduce the changeover costs through economies of scale.

WMRC remains poised to assist Member Councils, particularly as a degree of consistency and coordination is indicated.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.4.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Matt Scott Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED: 5/0

5.5 Operations Report

Business as usual continues at the West Metro Recycling Centre

Site

- New signage has been ordered for the front entrance to the site
- As anticipated with Town of Cambridge becoming a participating council, revenue from the entry fee has dropped from \$5,975.00 (239 entries) for Jul / Aug to just \$1,975.00 (79 entries) for Sept / Oct.

Construction and Demolition Waste

This remains a popular service with 235T of C&D Waste received since the service began on Jul 1st. Revenue from this new waste stream has already paid for the Pre-cast concrete walls that were purchased to establish the C&D storage bay AND also the walls purchased to establish the “free” mulch provided. These precast concrete walls will remain a valuable asset for the WMRC for many years.

New Services

Plant Pot recycling – Our latest exciting new service at the West Metro Recycling Centre for members and participating councils and residents started Oct 5th. Plants Pots are now collected and recycled by Claw Environmental who also recycle our large volumes of bulk polystyrene.

CDS drop off for Paraquad

Paraquad has provided two wheelie bins for collection of recyclables through the CDS. Weighbridge staff have also been provided information from Paraquad with regards to their location and the services they provide. This information is being passed on to our member council residents upon arrival at the recycling centre, To date most residents are choosing to go direct to Paraquad and receive the refund or possibly choosing another charity to donate to once at the Paraquad site.

Procurement

- Second-hand forklift purchased to assist staff with moving larger objects / IBC's around the site
- Three separate RFQ's have been drafted. These include
 - Fit out of the weighbridge office. The current facilities / décor in the weighbridge have not changed since the weighbridge office was first installed in 1992
 - Replacement silos for the Transfer station. The existing silo silos are long overdue an upgrade. This RFQ will provide some vital direction with regards to how the WMRC upgrades the existing transfer station infrastructure
 - Replacement of Silo 'Top Flap'. A critical piece of infrastructure that deflects waste into the silos. Current setup has been in place for over 10 years and needs attention.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.5.1 The information be received.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED: 5/0

5.6 Communications and Education Report

The introduction of Verge Valet in Cambridge has been an active area of work through this time.

In person activities have been held:

- Waste Watchers Workshop
- Modern Cloth Nappies Workshop
- Subiaco Farmers' Market stall
- Mosman Park Craft Fair stall
- Community Tour of the RRRC (SMRC facility)
- Community Dropoff Day 14 November, and
- various talks at community facilities, offices and for community groups

Plastic Free July has published its 2020 impact report. This indicates that around 15% of all WMRC Member Council residents took part and that between them their actions resulted in a projected annual 104T waste reduction in landfill waste and a 67T reduction in recycling waste generated across all Member Councils. This amounts to a 24.3kg/household/year waste reduction.

The second part of the bin tagging project has been completed with a few bins that were highly contaminated on multiple occasions being taped closed and not collected until decontaminated.

The team was not successful on either of the two grants applied for as part of DWERs WasteSorted funding round. There were over 150 applications (total value \$14million) submitted for a total of \$1.54million.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.6.1 The information be received.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Matt Scott CARRIED: 5/0

5.7 Financial Report

The WMRC continues to perform well:

- For September 2020, WMRC had an operating deficit of \$112,390 compared to a budgeted deficit of \$200,809 with a positive variance of \$88,419. See **Attachment 2a** for a Statement of Comprehensive Income and Statement of Financial Position as of 30 September 2020.
- For October 2020, WMRC had an operating deficit of \$247,927 compared to a budgeted operating deficit of \$248,617 with a negative variance of \$689. See **Attachment 2b** for a Statement of Comprehensive Income and Statement of Financial Position as of 31 October 2020.
- As at October, Council had a provisional operating surplus of \$114,717 compared to a budgeted operating surplus of \$1893 with a positive variance of \$112,824.

- As at 31 October, revenue for the year-to-date was provisionally 3.4% below budget and expenses 8.9% below budget.
- For the same period last financial year, owing to the receipt of court awarded legal costs of \$507k, Council had a provisional operating surplus of \$319,761 compared to a budgeted operating surplus of \$341,285 with a negative variance of \$21,523. Year to date revenue was 1% below budget and expenses were 2% above budget.

Note: these figures are subject to minor changes.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.7.1 The information be received.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED: 5/0

5.8 Progress on CEOAC Recommendations

An updated table highlighting the status of all CEOAC recommendations through to 19 November 2020 is provided at **Attachment 3**. All recommendations have been actioned apart from one on hold pending the resolution of the legal dispute with DiCOM.

The table is presented at each CEOAC meeting with completed items being presented once.

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

5.8.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED: 5/0

6. GENERAL BUSINESS

6.1 CEOAC Meeting Dates 2021

It is proposed that CEOAC meetings will generally be held electronically in 2021 on the same timetable as in previous years. The meetings will be on the third Thursday of the odd months of the year at 2pm. The proposed dates are as follows:

21	January
18	March
20	May
15	July
16	September
18	November

OFFICER'S and CEOAC RECOMMENDATION

6.1.1 That the 2021 CEOAC meeting dates, format and location/s be recommended to Council

Moved: Matt Scott Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED: 5/0

Note: these meetings will be of 1hr duration

6.2 Town of Cambridge Invitation

The CEO verbally suggested inviting a relevant senior member of the Town of Cambridge Administration staff to attend CEOAC meetings as an observer. The suggestion was received positively

6.3 Safeguarding the Low GO Price

The CEO briefed the Members on the need to reduce contamination on GO bins in order to keep the processing price, currently below market rates, as low as possible.

7. CLOSURE OF MEETING

Next Meeting

Thursday 21 January 2021, 14:00 hrs, electronically.

MINUTES

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICERS' ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING (CEOAC 04/2020)

17 September 2020
Commencing at 2:00 pm

Meeting held by e-meeting software (link under separate cover)

CONTENTS

1. DECLARATION OF OPENING & ELECTION OF NEW CHAIR AND DEPUTY	3
2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE AND APOLOGIES	3
3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES	3
4. MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION	4
4.1 Confidential Report – DiCOM Facility	4
5. INFORMATION ITEMS	5
5.1 WMRC Council Meeting Outcomes.....	5
5.2 Town of Cambridge joins WMRC as a Participating Council.....	5
5.3 Verge Valet	6
5.4 Waste Plans Progress.....	6
5.5 Waste to Energy Tender	7
5.6 Auditor General’s Report: Local Government Waste Management - Service Delivery	7
5.7 Operations Report.....	9
5.8 Communications and Education Report	10
5.9 Financial Report.....	11
5.10Progress on CEOAC Recommendations	12
6. GENERAL BUSINESS	12
7. CLOSURE OF MEETING.....	12
Next Meeting.....	12

WMRC Member Councils

Town of Claremont | Town of Cottesloe | Town of Mosman Park | City of Subiaco | Shire of Peppermint Grove
with Town of Cambridge

1. DECLARATION OF OPENING & ELECTION OF NEW CHAIR AND DEPUTY

Welcome and opening of meeting by Stefan Frodsham, CEO of the WMRC at 2:05pm

The CEOAC Terms of Reference provide for the annual election of a Chairperson and Deputy as follows:

4.2 A Chairperson and Deputy shall be elected for one year by a majority of members of the Committee. Further elections for these positions are to be held on an annual basis. In the event of either of these office holders no longer being available to exercise the role a supplementary election will be held.

Mr Don Burnett was the sole nominee for the role of Chairperson of the CEOAC to replace the outgoing Chairperson, Ms Rochelle Lavery. Ms Liz Ledger was the sole nominee for the role of Deputy. Both were duly elected for a period of 12 months as per item 4.2 of the Terms of Reference of the Committee.

2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE AND APOLOGIES

Member	Position	Council
Mr D Burnett (Chairperson)	Chief Executive Officer	Shire of Peppermint Grove
Ms C Bywater	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Mosman Park
Ms L Ledger (Deputy)	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Claremont
Mr M Scott	Chief Executive Officer	Town of Cottesloe
Mr C Frewing	Acting Chief Executive Officer	City of Subiaco
Visitors	Position	Council / Organisation
Mr S Frodsham	Chief Executive Officer	WMRC
Ms L Eustance	Manager Communications & Education	WMRC
Mr K Swift	Manager Operations	WMRC
Ms A Bell	Manager Finance & Governance	WMRC

Leave of Absence

Nil

Apologies

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

Draft minutes from the CEOAC meeting held on 16 July 2020 are at **Attachment 1**.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

3.1 The minutes of the CEOAC meeting held on 16 July 2020 be accepted as a true and proper record of that meeting.

Moved: Liz Ledger Seconded: Don Burnett CARRIED 5:0

4. MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION

4.1 Confidential Report – DiCOM Facility

The WMRC Chief Executive Officer will speak to the immediately previous confidential reports, emails and minutes which have been circulated to CEOAC members. The protocol followed is that all confidential and other information provided to WMRC Councillors is copied to CEOAC members.

The confidential reports, emails and minutes referred to above are not reproduced as an attachment to this agenda, but members are reminded they are:

- DiCOM Confidential Progress Report of 28 July 2020 dealt with at the WMRC Ordinary Meeting of 6 Aug 2020.

Members will be updated verbally on any new developments.

Answers to questions from members will be provided where possible.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

4.1.1 The verbal report of the WMRC CEO be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Matthew Scott CARRIED 5:0

5. INFORMATION ITEMS

5.1 WMRC Council Meeting Outcomes

WMRC held its most recent OCM on 6 August 2020. The Council at the meeting:

- endorsed the Audit Plan for 2020;
- approved discount rates for Participating Councils of 10% for bulk waste; and 15% for construction and demolition waste, and greenwaste.
- approved an ex-gratia payment to the estate of employee, the late John Cummins
- approved a 1.75% increase in wages and salaries applicable from 9 November 2020; and
- extended the CEO's contract to August 2023.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.1.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Liz Ledger CARRIED 5:0

5.2 Town of Cambridge joins WMRC as a Participating Council

Gaudete! The neighbouring Town of Cambridge has accepted an offer to join the WMRC as a Participating Council, for an initial period of 12 months during which time Cambridge will undertake a review to determine whether it will extend the arrangement into the longer term.

A Memorandum of Understanding, concluded between the WMRC and the Town of Cambridge on 2 September 2020, provides that Cambridge residents enjoy free entry to the West Metro Recycling Centre, and access to the free recycling services and mulch provided at the site. The arrangement resolves an issue of more than 25 years' standing which saw WMRC member councils funding the provision of waste management services to over 28,000 Cambridge residents without recompense; and is the culmination of two years' effort by WMRC.

We expect the arrangements will lead to further cooperation between WMRC and Cambridge as we are well placed to handle all of their greenwaste and bulk waste; and there may be opportunity to receive their residual (red-lid bin) waste for efficient transfer and haulage for disposal at Tamala Park. Cambridge is otherwise expressing a high degree of interest in taking on *Verge Valet*, for which we are having our lawyers draft a commercial service contract.

Our Communications and Education team and Town of Cambridge officers are already off and running in working in close collaboration. The approach to waste education and communications by Cambridge is of a high standard and very much in common with our own.

A copy of the MoU is provided at **Attachment 2**.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.2.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED 5:0

5.3 Verge Valet

The introduction of the Verge Valet service in Cottesloe has gone very well. The lessons learned and carefully documented by WMRC from the initial Mosman Park roll out were put to good effect in the deployment of Verge Valet at Cottesloe.

Feedback from Cottesloe residents has been complimentary. As we approach the traditional green and bulk waste seasons, we are working with the Town of Cottesloe staff to make sure that the promotion of the new service is as wide as possible. Town of Mosman Park collections continue to progress smoothly.

We are launching an updated web interface in the coming weeks which will include a 'top-up' option for those who have exhausted their collection allowances. This value-add service from WMRC will allow residents to book and pay for additional bulk waste pick-up services at a cost considerably less than having to hire a skip bin.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.3.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Carissa Bywater Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED 5:0

5.4 Waste Plans Progress

The WMRC has been progressing waste plan production with all five Member Councils. The current status is as shown below:

Council	Waste plan status as at early September 2020
Town of Claremont	First draft received back from DWER with very minor comments which are being dealt with.
Town of Cottesloe	In preparation for submission to Council for acceptance
Town of Mosman Park	In preparation for submission to Council for acceptance
Shire of Peppermint Grove	In preparation for submission to Council for acceptance
City of Subiaco	Draft waste plan presented at Council Briefing Forum 15/9/20
Western Metropolitan Regional Council	In preparation for submission to Council for acceptance

Part 1 of the plan provides the context/baseline against which Part 2; the Implementation Plan is developed. Councils to sign off on Part 2 of the Plan as this sets out how the local governments will deliver their services going forward (See Section 43(2) of the WARR Act 2007). Based on the Waste Plan being produced for the City of Subiaco the WMRC has provided sample text and data to include in Waste Plans for presentation to Councils. This can also be opened to community consultation if required. The WMRC has also provided a series of dot point describing the Waste Plan process and purpose for Member Council officers to consider including reports to their Council. Once a waste plan is accepted by Council, CEOs send the plan alongside a signed self-assessment checklist to DWER for approval.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.4.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Liz Ledger Seconded: Matthew Scott CARRIED 5:0

5.5 Waste to Energy Tender

WMRC Council at its 4 June OCM approved the release of a Request for Tender for a waste to energy service as an alternative to landfill for residual wastes. The RFT was advertised in the *West Australian* newspaper the following week on 11 June. The tender documents included a draft supply agreement drawn up by the WMRC's lawyers. The contract will be strictly on a residual waste arising basis (i.e. no tonnage commitment) and no undertakings will be given about waste composition or calorific value. The WMRC intends to make its WtE service available to all municipalities across its central west metropolitan catchment area.

The tender closed on Monday 13 July. Tender evaluation is well advanced.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.5.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED 5:0

5.6 Auditor General's Report: Local Government Waste Management - Service Delivery

This investigation by the Auditor General published on 20 August 2020 assessed whether:

- LG entities plan and deliver effective waste services to their communities; and
- the State Government provided adequate support to LG entities for local waste planning and service delivery.

The Auditor General last audited the State Government's role in waste management in 2016.

Findings

The Auditor General's principal findings in the August 2020 report were:

1. While DWER and the Waste Authority have substantially improved their support to LG entities in the last 5 years, the proportion of waste that is recycled in WA has not changed, and the State's performance remains below the national average.

Note: *Approximately 25% (~ \$20m) of waste levy revenue is allocated to waste-related activity by DWER and the Waste Authority. The level of direct support for LG from DWER and the Waste Authority remains low and is largely confined to the Better Bins Program, waste education and promotion, and the availability of some grant funding,*

2. High rates of contamination in recycling bins; inconsistent and irregular waste education; and limited local recycling infrastructure and markets for recycled commodities are issues that prevent wider adoption of better practice waste management. As a result, few LG entities are on track to meet the 2020 targets of 65% recovery of MSW in Perth and Peel regions; and 50% in major regional centres.

Note: *WMRC member councils with a third GO Bin are approaching 50% MSW recovery. WMRC itself doubled its recycling rate from 23% to 46% in 2019-20 – an excellent result, given that WMRC does not receive recyclables from kerbside collections. Evidence shows that LGs are unlikely to approach the 65% target without a FOGO service. The average MSW recovery across Perth and Peel based on 2017-18 data was 41%.*

WMRC is regarded as a leader in consistent communications and best practice waste education. Bin tagging across WMRC member councils demonstrate that recycling and GO bin contamination in the western suburbs is relatively low.

3. There are many examples of LG better practice, but few are consistently using them. For example, organic material accounts for half of household waste, our single biggest recycling opportunity. Using green waste collected from households to produce mulch for community parks and gardens, or composting food and garden organics to develop fertilisers, can significantly increase waste recovery.

Note: *All greenwaste received and collected by WMRC is processed into mulch and soil amendment products.*

4. Separating and recycling bulk rubbish is another simple way for LG entities to recover more waste and contribute to meeting the State's waste targets.

Note: *All bulk waste received or collected by WMRC has been consigned for recycling since August 2019.*

5. Local, regional and statewide waste planning is inadequate. Few LG entities had waste plans.

Note: *WMRC member councils are well advanced in completing their waste plans.*

6. The Waste Authority flagged State waste infrastructure planning as essential back in 2012, but little progress has been made since. It remains a key initiative that government, industry, and the community need to progress to ensure waste truly becomes a valued resource.

Note: *The lack of infrastructure planning is a contributing factor towards relatively poor use of transfer stations by LG, including by several LGs in WMRC's catchment area.*

7. Given recent international export bans on recyclable materials, the planning and development of local recycling facilities within the state is urgent needed to provide certainty

to stakeholders, create opportunities for local recycling industries, and protect our local environments.

Conclusion

WMRC and its member councils bear up well in comparison with the principal findings of the Auditor General's report, with member councils' and WMRC waste plans well advanced; a high standard of waste communications and education; and steadily improving recycling rates including from the introduction of GO bins, WMRC consigning all bulk waste for recycling, and growing patronage of the community recycling facilities at the West Metro Recycling Centre.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.6.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Matthew Scott Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED 5:0

5.7 Operations Report

Business as usual continues at the West Metro Recycling Centre amid uncertain times around COVID-19.

Licensing

WMRC applied to DEWR for increases in its licensed throughput at the West Metro Recycling Centre, principally to be ready to handle FOGO and increased amounts of C&D waste. DWER has approved the requested amendments.

This is an excellent outcome for the WMRC and our member councils as each of the amendments will further expand the level of service that we can offer:

- Putrescible Waste – 10,000 tonnes per year of food organic and garden organic waste (FOGO);
- Inert Waste Type 1 (*C&D Waste*) 10,000 tpa (originally 200 tpa);
- Special Waste Type 1 (*Asbestos*) 500 tonnes per year (originally 200 tpa);

In addition to the licence amendments, DWER officers recently carried out a compliance audit at the recycling center. We have not yet received the report from that audit however no non-conformances of any kind were noted on the day. DWER officers were very impressed with all activities witnessed at the facility.

Site

- New signage has been erected including speed / directional signs plus improved signage for services offered (E Waste / Cardboard / steel etc).
- Roller shutters have been placed on the windows at the weighbridge. The old-style grid shutters were cumbersome to raise and lower and therefore were left in place during working hours. The weighbridge is now a brighter place to work and most importantly a more welcoming place to visit.

- The wiring inside the weighbridge has been significantly tidied up. New power points provided for removing the over reliance on adaptors.
- A \$25 entry fee for non-member council residents was introduced July 1st and has proven a welcome source of revenue. To date over 250 residents have paid the \$25 entry fee. Now Cambridge have come onboard as a participating member these numbers will fall.

Construction and Demolition Waste

- This is already proving a popular service with 139 tonnes received since 1 July. All works crews at our member councils have been contacted to inform them of the new service. In addition, other surrounding councils such as Cambridge, Nedlands and City of Perth have also been made aware of the new service. It is expected that throughput will increase as awareness grows.

New Services

- **GiveWrite stationery wheelie bin** - We now accept new and near-new stationery. The stationery is then delivered to school kids who in are need of school supplies.
- **CDS drop off for Paraquad** – From October the recycling centre will provide an area for Paraquad to leave wheelie bins and collect recyclables through the CDS. Paraquad will benefit directly from all bottles / cans dropped off by residents. If residents would prefer to receive a refund, they will be directed to go to Paraquad's site.

Service Procurement

Second-hand forklift purchased. Expected delivery 2 – 3 weeks. The procurement will assist the WMRC realise other service opportunities, whilst removing some manual handling aspects of the role, and improving the efficiency of how staff move materials onsite.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.7.1 The information be received.

Moved: Liz Ledger Seconded: Cliff Frewing CARRIED 5:0

5.8 Communications and Education Report

The plan of activities including progress since 1 July is attached at **Attachment 3**. We will report on this again at mid-year.

The introduction of Verge Valet in Cottesloe has been an active area of work through this time.

In person activities are returning:

- Waste Watchers Workshop 24 September
- Community Dropoff Day 14 November, and
- various talks at community facilities, offices and for community groups

Bin tagging is set to resume early October to complete the project started in March. Bin taping is highly unlikely to occur because of the hiatus in the program.

The team has been corresponding with ParaQuad, who will be our local Containers for Change Refund point, to promote the scheme.

In addition, the team has applied for two grants as part of DWERs WasteSorted funding round, both are based on DWERs behaviour change campaign “Be a GREAT Sort” where each letter of GREAT refers to a specific waste behaviour (Give-Recycle-Earthcycle-Avoid-Take):

- Recycle Right by being a GREAT Sort – jointly with SMRC, materials for community activities and for use in schools.
- Be a GREAT Sort in the Western Suburbs – short videos set in the Western Suburbs.

OFFICER’S RECOMMENDATION

5.8.1 The information be received.

Moved: Liz Ledger Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED 5:0

5.9 Financial Report

The WMRC has begun the 20/21 financial year well:

- For July 2020, WMRC had an operating surplus of \$725,869 compared to a budgeted surplus of \$657,013 with a positive variance of \$68,856. See **Attachment 4a** for a Statement of Comprehensive Income and Statement of Financial Position as of 31 July 2020.
- For August 2020, WMRC had a provisional operating deficit of \$303,764 compared to a budgeted operating deficit of \$245,436 with a negative variance of \$58,328. See **Attachment 4b** for a Statement of Comprehensive Income and Statement of Financial Position as of 31 August 2020.
- As at August, Council had a provisional operating surplus of \$422,105 compared to a budgeted operating surplus of \$411,577 with a positive variance of \$10,528.
- As at 31 August, revenue for the year-to-date was provisionally 4% below budget and expenses are 6.5% below budget.
- For the same period last financial year, Council had a provisional operating surplus of \$346,903 compared to a budgeted operating surplus of \$396,457 with a negative variance of \$49,553. Revenue was 1% below budget and expenses were 4% above budget.

Note: these figures are subject to minor changes.

The 2019-20 Annual Financial Statements are currently being audited by Butler Settineri before being passed on to the Office of the Auditor General. The WMRC finished the 2019/20 financial year with a deficit of \$449,982 compared to a budgeted deficit of \$750,339 with a positive variance of \$300,416. The positive variance was achieved through revenue being 3.8% better than budgeted; and expenses being 3.1% lower than budgeted.

OFFICER’S RECOMMENDATION

5.9.1 The information be received.

Moved: Cliff Frewing Seconded: Matthew Scott CARRIED 5:0

5.10 Progress on CEOAC Recommendations

An updated table highlighting the status of all CEOAC recommendations through to 16 September 2020 is provided at **Attachment 5**. All recommendations have been actioned apart from one on hold pending the resolution of the legal dispute with DiCOM.

The table is presented at each CEOAC meeting with completed items being presented once.

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

5.10.1 The report be noted.

Moved: Liz Ledger Seconded: Carissa Bywater CARRIED 5:0

6. GENERAL BUSINESS

Don Burnett noted that he would likely be an apology for the next meeting.

7. CLOSURE OF MEETING

The meeting closed at 3:20

Next Meeting

Thursday 19 November 2020, 14:00 hrs, at the City of Subiaco or electronically.

Statement of Financial Position

WESTERN METROPOLITAN REGIONAL COUNCIL

As at 30 September 2020

	30 SEP 2020	31 AUG 2020	FORMULA
Current Assets			
Bank	150,522.94	310,585.00	(160,062.06)
Reserves	1,785,114.36	1,784,847.23	267.13
Debtors	334,621.09	402,620.34	(67,999.25)
Accrued Income	3,333.45	1,058.77	2,274.68
Total Current Assets	2,273,591.84	2,499,111.34	(225,519.50)
Non-current Assets			
Property, Plant & Equipment	1,278,643.53	1,285,986.25	(7,342.72)
Infrastructure	922,214.43	927,803.04	(5,588.61)
Right of Use Assets	95,429.62	95,776.20	(346.58)
Total Non-current Assets	2,296,287.58	2,309,565.49	(13,277.91)
Total Assets	4,569,879.42	4,808,676.83	(238,797.41)
Current Liabilities			
Lease Liability	45,800.43	45,800.43	-
Trade & Other Payables	275,318.81	410,437.80	(135,118.99)
Employee Related Provisions	215,974.96	208,667.26	7,307.70
Total Current Liabilities	537,094.20	664,905.49	(127,811.29)
Non-Current Liabilities			
Non-Current Long Service Leave	25,346.86	24,383.34	963.52
Total Non-Current Liabilities	25,346.86	24,383.34	963.52
Total Liabilities	562,441.06	689,288.83	(126,847.77)
Net Assets	4,007,438.36	4,119,388.00	(111,949.64)
Equity			
Asset Revaluation Reserve	289,498.36	289,498.36	-
Reserves	1,785,114.36	1,784,847.23	267.13
Retained Earnings	1,932,825.64	2,045,042.41	(112,216.77)
Total Equity	4,007,438.36	4,119,388.00	(111,949.64)

Budget Variance

WESTERN METROPOLITAN REGIONAL COUNCIL 1 Sep 2020 to 30 Sep 2020

	Actual	Budget	Var AUD	Var %	YTD Actual	YTD Budget	Var AUD	Var %
Income								
Revenue from Ordinary Activities								
Fees & Charges	269,972	280,727	(10,755)▼	-3.8%▼	765,022	842,204	(77,182)▼	-9.2%▼
Interest	1,076	1,917	(841)▼	-43.9%▼	3,267	5,751	(2,484)▼	-43.2%▼
Operating Grants, Subsidies and Contributions	31,292	785	30,507▲	3886.2%▲	939,338	909,960	29,378▲	3.2%▲
Other Income	2,297	5,833	(3,536)▼	-60.6%▼	20,334	17,499	2,835▲	16.2%▲
Total Revenue from Ordinary Activities	304,637	289,262	15,375	5.3%	1,727,961	1,775,414	(47,453)	-2.7%
Total Income	304,637	289,262	15,375	5.3%	1,727,961	1,775,414	(47,453)	-2.7%
Less Cost of Sales								
Expenses from Ordinary Activities								
Depreciation & Amortisation	13,596	11,254	2,342▲	20.8%▲	40,788	33,711	7,077▲	21.0%▲
Employee Costs	134,086	125,119	8,967▲	7.2%▲	456,031	402,117	53,914▲	13.4%▲
Insurance	-	-	-	0.0%	25,912	31,146	(5,234)▼	-16.8%▼
Materials & Contracts	256,338	274,169	(17,831)▼	-6.5%▼	772,634	839,503	(66,869)▼	-8.0%▼
Other Expenses	12,160	79,068	(66,908)▼	-84.6%▼	65,469	217,004	(151,535)▼	-69.8%▼
Utilities	408	1,126	(718)▼	-63.8%▼	4,041	3,378	663▲	19.6%▲
Total Expenses from Ordinary Activities	416,587	490,736	(74,149)	-15.1%	1,364,875	1,526,859	(161,984)	-10.6%
Total Cost of Sales	416,587	490,736	(74,149)	-15.1%	1,364,875	1,526,859	(161,984)	-10.6%
Gross Profit	(111,950)	(201,474)	89,524	44.0%	363,085	248,555	114,530	46.0%

Budget Variance

	Actual	Budget	Var AUD	Var %	YTD Actual	YTD Budget	Var AUD	Var %
Plus Other Income								
Asset Disposal - Profit/(Loss)	-	666	(666)▼	-100.0%▼	-	1,998	(1,998)▼	-100.0%▼
Total Other Income	-	666	(666)	-100.0%	-	1,998	(1,998)	-100.0%
Net Profit	(111,950)	(200,808)	88,858	44.0%	363,085	250,553	112,532	45.0%

Budget Variance

WESTERN METROPOLITAN REGIONAL COUNCIL 1 Oct 2020 to 31 Oct 2020

	Actual	Budget	Var AUD	Var %	YTD Actual	YTD Budget	Var AUD	Var %
Income								
Revenue from Ordinary Activities								
Fees & Charges	265,664	280,727	(15,063)▼	-5.4%▼	1,030,686	1,122,931	(92,245)▼	-8.2%▼
Interest	1,056	1,917	(861)▼	-44.9%▼	4,322	7,668	(3,346)▼	-43.6%▼
Operating Grants, Subsidies and Contributions	55	785	(730)▼	-93.1%▼	939,393	910,745	28,648▲	3.1%▲
Other Income	2,070	5,833	(3,763)▼	-64.5%▼	22,403	23,332	(929)▼	-4.0%▼
Total Revenue from Ordinary Activities	268,844	289,262	(20,418)	-7.1%	1,996,805	2,064,676	(67,871)	-3.3%
Total Income	268,844	289,262	(20,418)	-7.1%	1,996,805	2,064,676	(67,871)	-3.3%
Less Cost of Sales								
Expenses from Ordinary Activities								
Depreciation & Amortisation	13,596	11,254	2,342▲	20.8%▲	54,384	44,965	9,419▲	20.9%▲
Employee Costs	158,699	153,430	5,269▲	3.4%▲	619,424	560,234	59,190▲	10.6%▲
Insurance	22,597	31,146	(8,549)▼	-27.4%▼	48,509	62,292	(13,783)▼	-22.1%▼
Materials & Contracts	263,436	272,621	(9,185)▼	-3.4%▼	1,031,817	1,107,480	(75,663)▼	-6.8%▼
Other Expenses	58,443	68,968	(10,525)▼	-15.3%▼	123,912	285,972	(162,060)▼	-56.7%▼
Utilities	-	1,126	(1,126)▼	-100.0%▼	4,041	4,504	(463)▼	-10.3%▼
Total Expenses from Ordinary Activities	516,772	538,545	(21,773)	-4.0%	1,882,088	2,065,447	(183,359)	-8.9%
Total Cost of Sales	516,772	538,545	(21,773)	-4.0%	1,882,088	2,065,447	(183,359)	-8.9%
Gross Profit	(247,928)	(249,283)	1,355	1.0%	114,717	(771)	115,488	14979.0%

Budget Variance

	Actual	Budget	Var AUD	Var %	YTD Actual	YTD Budget	Var AUD	Var %
Plus Other Income								
81112 - Asset Disposal - Profit/(Loss)	-	666	(666)▼	-100.0%▼	-	2,664	(2,664)▼	-100.0%▼
Total Other Income	-	666	(666)	-100.0%	-	2,664	(2,664)	-100.0%
Net Profit	(247,928)	(248,617)	689	0.0%	114,717	1,893	112,824	5960.0%

Statement of Financial Position

WESTERN METROPOLITAN REGIONAL COUNCIL

As at 31 October 2020

	31 OCT 2020	30 SEP 2020	FORMULA
Current Assets			
Bank	165,853.84	150,522.94	15,330.90
Reserves	1,634,306.93	1,785,114.36	(150,807.43)
Debtors	264,080.87	334,621.09	(70,540.22)
Accrued Income	3,163.72	3,333.45	(169.73)
Total Current Assets	2,067,405.36	2,273,591.84	(206,186.48)
Non-current Assets			
Property, Plant & Equipment	1,284,691.03	1,278,643.53	6,047.50
Infrastructure	916,625.82	922,214.43	(5,588.61)
Right of Use Assets	95,083.04	95,429.62	(346.58)
Total Non-current Assets	2,296,399.89	2,296,287.58	112.31
Total Assets	4,363,805.25	4,569,879.42	(206,074.17)
Current Liabilities			
Lease Liability	45,800.43	45,800.43	-
Trade & Other Payables	308,669.35	275,759.10	32,910.25
Employee Related Provisions	223,235.05	215,974.96	7,260.09
Total Current Liabilities	577,704.83	537,534.49	40,170.34
Non-Current Liabilities			
Non-Current Long Service Leave	27,029.96	25,346.86	1,683.10
Total Non-Current Liabilities	27,029.96	25,346.86	1,683.10
Total Liabilities	604,734.79	562,881.35	41,853.44
Net Assets	3,759,070.46	4,006,998.07	(247,927.61)
Equity			
Asset Revaluation Reserve	289,498.36	289,498.36	-
Reserves	1,634,306.93	1,785,114.36	(150,807.43)
Retained Earnings	1,835,265.17	1,932,385.35	(97,120.18)
Total Equity	3,759,070.46	4,006,998.07	(247,927.61)

Meeting Date	Item Number	CEOAC Recommendation	Description	Status	Notes
21 Mar 2019	4.3.1	The WMRC operating model be revisited once the current legal dispute is resolved.	Our legal advisers hold that WMRC's interests would best be served by awaiting the end of the dispute with DiCOM before any approach to the market about private operation of the West Metro Recycling Centre is made.	On hold	The uncertainties surrounding the future of the operation of DiCOM on the site, including terms of lease, would be priced into any bid to privately operate the site.